קינוחים

יד. פירות הבאים לקינוח סעודה מברך עליהם ברכה ראשונה, ואין מברך עליהם ברכה אחרונה, דברכת המזון פוטרתם [ראה ש"ע סעיף א-ב]. וכן האוכל פירות מבושלים בסוכר (קומפוט) בסוף הסעודה, במקום פירות רגילים, צריך לברך עליהם ברכת "בורא פרי העץ". [יחו"ד ח"ה סי' יט הליכו"ע ח"ב עמ' צט]

טו. האוכל מיני מתיקה בסוף הסעודה, לקינוח, מברך לפניהם כברכתם. אולם לגבי גלידה נחלקו הפוסקים, יש אומרים שמכיון שהיא ספק משקים, פטורה מן הברכה מספק, ועדיף שיניחנה לאחר ברכת המזון. [ילקו"י ח"ג עמ' קצח]. ויש אומרים שאף לצד שחשיבא משקים, הרי מכל מקום לא באה הגלידה בשביל לשרות המאכל, ולכן יש לברך עליה. [הלכה ברורה עמ' קצג]

Desserts

No blessing after eating fruit in a meal

14) When someone is served fruit as a dessert, he must recite a separate blessing before eating it but it is not necessary to recite a separate blessing after eating the fruit. This is the rule whether he eats raw fruit or cooked fruit.[56] *Birkat Hamazon* covers all the food he has eaten, including any food he might have eaten for dessert.

Ice cream for dessert

15) When eating sweets as a dessert after a meal, it is necessary to recite a separate blessing before eating them. Some *Poskim* ruled that ice cream might be considered a beverage even in its frozen state. If it is a beverage, no separate blessing is necessary since the blessing of *hamotzi* covers all beverages, sweetened or otherwise. Since the status of ice cream is in doubt, they recommended refraining from eating such a dessert until after reciting *Birkat Hamazon*.

Other *Poskim* reasoned that even if ice cream is considered a beverage one must recite a separate blessing to eat it. The blessing of *hamotzi* covers any beverage that one might drink to wash down the food, but ice cream is not eaten for that purpose and therefore the blessing of *hamotzi* does not cover it. Since this issue is unresolved, it is best to first recite

bread with the first bite of fruit. This is the halakha presented here.

b) If someone eats fruit as a side dish but not as the main course, he must recite a blessing on the fruit unless he eats bread with the first bite of fruit and with the final bite of fruit. This was explained above in halakha 10, and it is recommended that one purposely eat the first bite of fruit without bread and recite a separate blessing.

c) If someone eats fruit as a dessert after his meal, he must recite a separate blessing unless he eats bread with each bite of the fruit. This was explained above in the footnote to halakha 10.

56. The *Magen Avraham* (177) ruled that it is necessary to recite a separate blessing over cooked fruit since they are not a food that accompanies bread. This ruling was accepted by the *Aharonim* and the *Mishna Berura* (177:4), and it disputes the *Zokhrenu Lehayim* who ruled that no separate blessing is necessary for fruits cooked with sugar or honey such as the compote commonly served at banquet meals. The *Sede Hemed* (*ma'arekhet berakhot* #1:26) took issue with his ruling, as cited by Maran the Rishon Letziyon (responsa *Yehave Da'at* Vol. V, #19).

ולמעשה נראה, שיותר נכון לדחות הגלידה לאוכלה לאחר ברכת המזון, ואז יברך עליה "שהכל נהיה בדברו". [מרן הראש"ל שליט"א בגליון היבי"א ח"ה סי' יח]

Birkat Hamazon and then recite a blessing (*shehakol nihya bidvaro*) over the ice cream and eat it.[57]

57. The *Or Letziyon* (Vol. II, page 103) states that dairy ice cream is definitely not a beverage and therefore one must definitely recite a separate blessing before eating it as dessert. The same applies to a pareve ice cream based on whipped eggs. Sorbet made with other liquids, however, is considered a beverage and therefore no blessing is to be recited over it during a meal. Popsicles are likewise considered beverages for this purpose.

These rulings are based on the words of Rambam (*Hilkhot Tum'at Okhalim* 9:1) ruling that regarding the halakhot of *tum'a* and *tahora*, frozen milk is considered a food but other frozen liquids retain the status of beverages. It is likely that the *Or Letziyon* would agree that most of today's commercial dairy ice cream is considered a beverage since it is produced from water and powdered milk. Therefore, he would agree that no separate blessing is necessary when eating ice cream as dessert unless one knows for a fact that it is made of genuine milk or whipped eggs.

The first opinion cited in the halakha above is that of the *Yalkut Yosef* (Vol. III, page 198). It states there that Maran the Rishon Letziyon ruled that there is no difference between different types of ice cream, that in every case no separate blessing may be recited. The act of eating ice cream is actually an act of drinking a very cold beverage bit by bit. It cannot be considered a solid food since people do not chew it before swallowing. This is likewise the opinion of responsa *Kinyan Torah* (Vol. IV, #19, 20).

The second opinion cited in the halakha above is that of the *Halakha Berura* (page 194). It states that even if ice cream has the status of a beverage a separate blessing is necessary when eating it as a dessert. The blessing of *hamotzi* covers all beverages since they are considered an integral part of the meal; people drink them to help wash down the food they have eaten. Ice cream is not eaten for this purpose; it is simply a dessert and the blessing of *hamotzi* does not cover it. A separate blessing is therefore necessary. The *Halakha Berura* testifies that Maran the Rishon Letziyon recited a separate blessing when he was served ice cream as a dessert.

During Shabbat meals or *Yom Tov* meals when kiddush is recited and everyone tastes some wine, however, all beverages that someone might drink afterward are covered by the blessing of *bore peri hagefen* whether he drinks them to wash down his food or for any other purpose. Therefore, in case the ice cream is considered a beverage no separate blessing would be necessary. Since we are unsure whether the ice cream is considered a solid or a beverage, it is best to first recite *Birkat Hamazon* and then eat the ice cream.

The *Birkat Hashem* (Vol. II, pages 55-59; Vol. III, page 368) discussed this issue at length and concluded that ice cream is considered a food, not a beverage. Accordingly, after eating *kazayit* of ice cream when one has not eaten bread, one is obligated to recite the blessing of *bore nefashot*.

Harav Shelomo Zalman Auerbach, Harav Yosef Shalom Elyashiv (both cited in *sefer Vezot Haberakha*, chapter 8, footnote 12), responsa *Shevet Halevi* and responsa *Even Yisrael* Fisher all concurred with the ruling of the *Halakha Berura*. Nevertheless, the logic of this opinion is not foolproof. No one can guarantee that when a person eats an ice cream dessert his intentions are not to wash down his food with it. If he does have such intentions and ice cream is considered a beverage, no separate blessing may be recited. It is not possible, therefore, to make a hard-and-fast rule that one must recite a separate blessing on an ice cream dessert.

Although the *Halakha Berura* testified that Maran the Rishon Letziyon did recite a separate blessing on ice cream served to him as a dessert, the *Yalkut Yosef* (Vol. III, page 707) testified that when his father, Maran the Rishon Letziyon, was served ice cream for dessert he set it aside until after reciting *Birkat Hamazon*. It is not possible, therefore, to rely on either testimony. The general rule is that one must attempt to avoid situations where the halakha is in doubt, and in this case it is best to postpone eating the ice cream until after reciting *Birkat Hamazon*. The responsa *Hemdat Avraham* Dayan (Vol. III, #10) dealt with this issue at length and concurred with the *Poskim* who ruled that one must recite a separate blessing when eating ice cream as dessert. Nevertheless, he recommended that one first recite *Birkat Hamazon* and then eat the ice cream, as written above.

In Maran the Rishon Letziyon's personal set of responsa *Yabia Omer* (Vol. V, #18), he handwrote a note in the margin refuting the position of the *Ma'ase Nissim* Kachuri and the *Or Letziyon* differentiating between dairy ice cream and pareve ice cream. He insisted that the principle of *safek berakhot lehakel* must be applied in every case. Therefore, one should refrain from eating the ice cream dessert until after one recites *Birkat Hamazon*

טז. אם אכל בתוך הסעודה פרי או ירק כבוש או מבושל, שאינו טעון ברכה כלל, שהרי בא מחמת הסעודה, ושוב הובא לפניו מאותו פרי או ירק כשהוא חי לקינוח סעודה, צריך לברך עליו ברכה ראשונה.

Pickles

16) No separate blessing is necessary when eating a pickled fruit or vegetable, or a cooked vegetable. These foods are ordinary side dishes and are covered by the blessing of *hamotzi*. If someone ate a pickled vegetable during a meal and afterward he was served a raw vegetable of the same type, he must recite a separate blessing to eat the raw vegetable.

Chocolate-covered ice cream

Nowadays, many people serve ice cream bars covered with chocolate candy that people can pick up with their fingers and eat. Since the chocolate is definitely not a beverage, one might think that it is definitely necessary to recite a separate blessing on this dessert. The chocolate covering, however, is likely considered subordinate to the ice cream. Therefore, if the ice cream itself does not necessitate a separate blessing, the chocolate does not necessitate one either. This can be compared to the ruling of the *Hatam Sofer* about drinking coffee after reciting a blessing over wine and eating a sugar cube along with the coffee. He ruled in his responsa that the sugar is subordinate to the coffee and since no blessing is necessary for the coffee, none is necessary for the sugar either.

Instant pudding and Jell-O

The *Halakha Berura* (page 193), following his reasoning, ruled that one must definitely recite a separate blessing when eating these desserts. Even according to the *Or Letziyon* and the *Yalkut Yosef*, it is likely that these desserts are definitely considered foods and not beverages since they do not melt at room temperature. Therefore, it would seem that all *Poskim* agree that a separate blessing is necessary. Actually, the *Or Letziyon* (footnote on page 103) states as much.

The *Yalkut Yosef* (page 197), however, states that he asked his father, Maran the Rishon Letziyon, and he replied that the proper course of action is to recite a blessing over a candy having in mind to cover the pudding. Alternatively, one may recite *Birkat Hamazon* first and then eat the dessert. Apparently, he felt that these substances might be considered beverages since they are mainly water and can possibly be eaten to wash down one's meal.

The author of *Halakha Berura* related (Vol. X, page 513) that he asked his father, Maran the Rishon Letziyon, about this issue and that he replied any food that one cannot drink is considered a solid. If someone consumes *kazayit* within the time span of *kede akhilat peras*, he must recite a *berakha aharona*. According to this, if someone is served a pudding or Jell-O as dessert after a meal, he must recite a blessing before eating it.

Dairy puddings

The above discussion applies to all sorts of puddings, including those that are milk-based. Yogurt, howerver, (plain or flavored), might be considered a beverage and would not need a separate blessing if eaten as dessert. This is the ruling of the *Piske Teshuvot* (page 788).

Mousse and Meringue

The *Poskim* who ruled that a separate blessing is necessary for ice cream definitely would rule likewise regarding these desserts. The *Or Letziyon* would agree in this case since they are technically foods and not beverages. The opinion of Maran the Rishon Letziyon as presented in the *Yalkut Yosef*, however, seems to be that no separate blessing should be recited even for these desserts. According to the testimony of the *Halakha Berura* cited earlier, Maran the Rishon Letziyon ruled that any food that one cannot drink has the status of a food and not a beverage. These desserts, therefore, are considered solid foods. Ice cream is different – it might have the status of a beverage and therefore it is best to postpone eating it until after reciting *Birkat Hamazon*.

Eating bread with ice cream or pudding

One might think that one can avoid these doubts by eating bread together with the first spoonful of ice cream and together with the final spoonful of ice cream. This is not true, however. Since it is eaten as a dessert and not as a side dish, one would have to eat bread with every single spoonful in order to avoid having to recite a separate blessing. Above in halakha 10 and the footnote there, it was explained that if someone wishes to eat fruit as dessert he must recite a separate blessing unless he eats bread with every bite of fruit.

There is reason to say, however, that even if someone eats bread with every spoonful of ice cream he still needs a separate blessing on it. The *sefer Vezot Haberakha* (page 232) discusses this issue and ruled that if someone eats bread

וכן אם בתוך הסעודה אכל סלט ירקות חי, ובתוכו חתיכות מלפפון [שלא מברך עליו] ובסוף הסעודה הביאו לפניו מלפפון חי לקינוח, צריך לברך עליו, שמכיון שמתחלה היה בתערובת, ונשתנה, הרי פנים חדשות באו לכאן. ומכל מקום אם יש לפניו פרי או ירק ממין אחר, שכלל לא אכל ממנו קודם, טוב שיברך על המין האחר, ויפטור את המין השני, אבל אין זה מעכב. [הליכו"ע ח"ב עמ' לז ובהערה, יחו"ד ח"ה סי' יט]

Likewise, if someone ate a tossed salad during his meal and it included pieces of cucumber, and afterward he was served a plain cucumber, he must recite a separate blessing for the plain raw cucumber. It is not considered a continuation of the salad he ate earlier since the combined salad is one entity and the plain cucumber is considered a different food altogether. Nonetheless, it is best to recite the blessing of *bore peri ha'adama* over a vegetable or fruit that was not included in the salad and then to eat the cucumber. This is not obligatory, it is only the recommended course if it is possible.[58]

together with fruit only in order to avoid reciting a separate blessing on it, the fruit does not become subordinate to the bread and he still must recite a separate blessing for the fruit. Eating the fruit with bread helps only if he considers the fruit to be a condiment for the bread, thus making the fruit subordinate to the bread. If he eats the bread only to solve the issue of the blessing and does not consider the fruit as a condiment for the bread, he has accomplished nothing. When someone eats ice cream as a dessert, it is unlikely that he would choose to enjoy it as a spread for a sandwich. Therefore, it is recommended not to rely on eating bread with the ice cream, but to recite *Birkat Hamazon* and then to eat it. This is the conclusion of the *Kinyan Torah*, cited in *Piske Teshuvot* (page 528).

58. The *Shulḥan Arukh* (177:1) includes vegetables as foods that are an integral part of a meal. The *sefer Bet David* (*Siman* 85) explained that this applies to cooked or pickled vegetables only, since they serve the purpose of whetting one's appetite. If someone wishes to eat raw vegetables such as lettuce, cucumbers or squash during a meal, he needs to recite a separate blessing for them. Harav ḤIDA (*Birke Yosef* 177:1) testified that this is the common custom. He added that even if someone had eaten cooked vegetables during the meal, if he wishes to eat a raw vegetable of the same type afterward he must recite a separate blessing. Raw vegetables during a meal have the same status as fruit.

The *sefer Kodshe David* Ḥassan (*Siman* 177) disagreed with this ruling, stating that if someone has eaten cooked vegetables during a meal, no separate blessing is necessary to eat a raw specimen of the same vegetable. He reasoned that vegetables, raw or cooked, can always be considered a side dish for the meal. Furthermore, since he already ate cooked vegetables of the same type, the raw vegetable is just a continuation of that eating. The responsa *Zekhor leYitzḥak* Harari (#48) took this opinion into account and ruled that in such a case the person should recite the blessing of *bore peri ha'adama* on a different vegetable before eating the one that is the same as the cooked vegetable he ate beforehand. A number of *Aḥaronim*, including the *Ḥesed La'alafim*, the *Ben Ish Ḥai* and the *Kaf Haḥayim* Sofer, concurred with this.

It is clear from all these *Aḥaronim* that if someone eats raw vegetables after a meal and he has not eaten that type of cooked vegetable during the meal, he definitely must recite a separate blessing. Although the *Poskim* debated the halakha in this case as well, the *Aḥaronim* did not take the other opinion into account. They knew that the common custom is to recite the blessing in this case, and the custom overrides the principle of *safek berakhot lehakel*. It is only in a case where the person had already eaten cooked vegetables of the same type and now wishes to eat a raw one that the *Aḥaronim* took the opinion of the *Kodshe David* into account. One must not recite a blessing in this case, however, since it is not clear that the custom extends to this case.

Harav ḤIDA agreed with the rulings of the *Bet David*. This is likewise the position of the *Peteḥ Hadevir*, and Maran the Rishon Letziyon (responsa *Yeḥave Da'at*) concurred with this in practice. Even so, he recommended that the blessing be recited over a different vegetable, not the type that was eaten as a cooked vegetable during the meal. If this is not possible, it is not necessary.

The *Halakha Berura* (page 176) pointed out that it appears from the Ritba unlike the ruling of Harav ḤIDA, but that it is not a clear proof against him. In practice, he concurred with the ruling given here.