מדיני הקדיש

טו. האומרים קדיש יקפידו לומר הקדיש ביחד, ולא יהיה אחד מקדים ואחד מאחר, כי אז מבלבלים את העונים. [כה"ח פאלאגי' סי' יג אות יא, כה"ח סופר ס"ק ל]. וע"ע לקמן הלכה מ"ז.

וכששומע קדיש משנים ואחד מקדים את חבירו, יענה אחר המקדים, ועולה לו כאילו ענה על שניהם. ואם יש הפסק בשיעור יותר מכדי דיבור ביניהם, יענה 'אמן' על כל אחד ואחד. [ע"פ חס"ל סי' נו ה"ו, באו"ח ויחי סוף הי"א, מקבציאל שם הל"ח. וע"ע במשנ"ב סי' נה סק"ד, כה"ח סי' נו סק"ח]

Details About Kaddish

Recite kaddish in unison

15) If several people in the congregation are reciting kaddish, they should make sure to recite it in unison at the same pace. If some people recite it quickly and others recite it slowly, it will confuse those who are listening and trying to respond. See below in halakha 47.

How to respond to several people at once

If one person recites the kaddish slightly more quickly than another, the people listening should respond to the one who is quicker. It will count for them as if they responded to both people reciting it. If the first person reaches the words *ve'imru Amen* a full second earlier than the second person, the congregation should respond Amen to the first person and again to the second person. The same applies to any point in kaddish where the congregation is supposed to respond.[400]

Amen since he did not hear the first words of kaddish. The *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer and the *Halakha Berura* both ruled that in this case he may definitely respond Amen. It is possible to interpret the words of the *Ben Ish Hai* to concur with their ruling.

If the cantor has begun the sentence of *Yehe Shemeh rabba*, anyone who enters the synagogue at that point should definitely not respond Amen. Since the cantor has already begun a new sentence, it is no longer possible to respond Amen to his previous sentence. This can be compared to a case where the cantor who is repeating the *Amida* begins the next blessing before the congregation has responded Amen to the previous blessing – they can no longer respond Amen.

400. The *Ben Ish Hai* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 11) ruled that the people reciting kaddish are not in unison, the congregation should respond to the person who reaches the words *Ve'imru Amen* first. In his *Sefer Mikabtze'el* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 38) he added, citing the *Hesed La'alafim* (56:6), that if there is a full second between the two, the congregation should respond to each of them.

These rulings were preceded by the responsa *Halakhot Ketanot* (Vol. II, #48). He ruled, however, that as long as the two people reciting kaddish are within one second of each other, the listener may choose to answer the one or the other, and this ruling is cited in the *Mishna Berura* (55:4) and the *Hesed La'alafim* (56:6). If they both reach that point within a second of one another, the listener can respond to either one and it will count as a response to both. Apparently, according to the *Ben Ish Hai* and the *Hesed La'alafim*, it is preferable to respond to the one who recites the kaddish more quickly. More research is needed to determine why they favored this formula.

If someone is in a place where several groups of people are praying, each forming an independent minyan, it can happen that one group begins kaddish while its neighboring group is already in the middle of kaddish. In this case, the person listening should respond only to first group. Although he could technically respond to both, it is incorrect to mix up the order of one's responses. This cannot be compared to two people reciting kaddish together where one of them recites it at a faster pace.

Upon hearing kaddish and a blessing

The *Hesed La'alafim* (56:13, cited in *Mikabtze'el parashat Vayehi* halakha 44) ruled that if someone hears kaddish and at the same time he hears someone else recite a blessing, he should respond *Amen ve'Amen*.

טז. האומר קדיש יש לו להגביה קולו שיהיה נשמע ויענו אחריו "אמן" [ראה משנ"ב סי' קלט ס"ק כד]. ומי שקולו נמוך ואינו יכול להשמיע קולו לאחרים, רשאי לומר קדיש, אולם לכתחילה יחגור בעוז מתניו לומר הקדיש בהגבהת קולו כל מה שאפשר, וישתדל מאוד שיהיה קולו נשמע לפחות לשנים שלושה אנשים הסמוכים לו. [ראה פתה"ד סי' קכה אות ב, באה"ח פי' ויחי הט"ז, כה"ח סי' נה ס"ק לב. וע"ע חזו"ע אבלות ח"א עמ' שנג]

יז. עשרה שנמצאים בבית הכנסת ורוצים כולם לומר קדיש, רשאים כולם לומר הקדיש אף שאין מי שיענה אחריהם "אמן". [פתה"ד סי' קכה אות ה, שו"ת רב פעלים ח"ב סי' יד]. ולכתחלה אם אפשר טוב שאחד יהיה עונה אחריהם "אמן". [ראה באה"ח סו"פ ויחי]. ויותר טוב שנים. [כה"ח סי' נה סוף ס"ק לא]

Recite kaddish loudly

16) When someone recites kaddish, he should raise his voice so that the congregation can hear him and respond Amen to him. If someone is incapable of raising his voice, he may still recite kaddish. He should try, if possible, to make every effort to raise his voice as much as possible. He should at least make sure that at least the two or three people closest to him hear him reciting it.[401]

The entire congregation reciting kaddish

17) If ten people are present in the synagogue and all of them wish to recite kaddish, this is permissible although there is no one to respond Amen to them. In this situation, they should try to persuade one person to volunteer not to recite kaddish and instead to respond to the others. It is best, in fact, if at least two people would volunteer to respond instead of reciting kaddish.[402]

---

401. The *Petah Hadevir* (125:2) ruled that it is permissible for someone to recite kaddish silently as long as there are others in the congregation who are reciting it out loud. Even though the person reciting it is supposed to tell the others, "*ve'imru Amen*," inviting them to respond to him, it is alright as long as the congregation responds to kaddish out loud in response to all those who are reciting it. This is likewise the ruling of the responsa *Rav Pe'alim* (Vol. II, #14). In the *Ben Ish Hai* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 16) he added that the practice in Yerushalayim's Yeshivat Bet El was that the cantor recited kaddish slowly, with all the meditations ascribed to each word. Anyone in the congregation who wished to recite kaddish as well but who did not know the kabbalistic meditations recited it silently along with the cantor. Despite this testimony, the *Ben Ish Hai* concluded that in ordinary congregations, people should not do this. Instead, each person should recite kaddish out loud.

The responsa *Binyan Tziyon* (#122), however, ruled that it is forbidden to recite kaddish silently along with the cantor. The *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (55:32) concurred with the practice observed in Yerushalayim's Yeshivat Bet El, but he recommended that the person stand at some distance from the cantor and recite kaddish loud enough for at least two or three people to hear him and respond to him.

The *Or Letziyon* (Vol. II, 5:7) ruled that if someone is in a congregation where many people are reciting kaddish, each one at his own pace – and as a result no one can really hear and respond to anyone's kaddish, it is permissible to recite kaddish along with them even though no one at all hears him or responds to him. He explained that this practice relies on the Talmud's statement (*Sanhedrin* 39a) that the Shekhina is present wherever there are ten Jews together. Still, if someone can, he should raise his voice above the others in an attempt to force the others to adjust themselves to his pace. In this way, he brings honor to the synagogue and to Heaven.

402. Harav Eliyahu Mani, cited in responsa *Rav Pe'alim* (Vol. II, #14) ruled that it is permissible for the entire congregation to recite kaddish in unison. This is likewise the ruling of the *Bene Yehuda* Ayash and the *Petah Hadevir*. Although the text of kaddish includes the words *ve'imru Amen*, which is a command to the congregation to respond Amen, it does not matter that there is no one present to physically obey that command. To prove this, he pointed to the text we recite as we complete the silent *Amida*, which includes the same phrase *ve'imru Amen*. In that case, the command is directed toward the angels who hear our silent prayers, and we can

דיני עמידה בקדיש

יח. מי שהיה עומד, והתחילו לומר קדיש, אינו רשאי לשבת באמצע הקדיש, ואפילו כל הקהל יושבים, אלא ישאר עומד עד שיסיים לענות "יהא שמה רבא" עד "דאמירן בעלמא".

Standing Up for Kaddish

Remain standing for kaddish

18) If an individual was standing up when the cantor began reciting kaddish, he must not sit down while it is being recited although the rest of the congregation is seated. He must remain standing until he responds *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* through the words *de'amiran be'alma*.[403] Moreover, if someone who is standing up notices

say that the phrase in kaddish is likewise directed toward the angels. Alternatively, there might be people outside the synagogue who can hear the kaddish, and the phrase is directed to whoever might hear it.

The *Ben Ish Hai* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 16) repeated the ruling found in *Rav Pe'alim*, and he added that it is still best to arrange for at least one person to respond Amen. This is an adjustment to his ruling in the *Rav Pe'alim*; such a recommendation does not appear there. In the newest edition of the *Ben Ish Hai*, the text is corrected to make this clear. The *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (55:31) pointed out that if the reason for having someone respond is to justify the phrase of *ve'imru Amen*, it is necessary to have at least two people responding since the command is in the plural form.

403. Harav Yaakov Moelin, cited in the *Darkhe Moshe* (56:5), testified that when he was seated in the synagogue he did not rise from his seat when the cantor began reciting kaddish or *Barekhu*. If he was already standing when the cantor began, however, he remained standing until he finished responding *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*. The *Darkhe Moshe* then commented that the common custom is to rise from one's seat in all cases, adding that the *Hagahat Mordekhi* (printed in the *Shilte Hagiborim* in the fourth chapter of *Berakhot*, #5) cited a passage from the Talmud Yerushalmi stating: Ribbi Eliezer said, "When responding *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* or any other sanctified passage, one must stand up." See more about this source in the responsa *Hayim Le'olam* Moda'i (*O.H.* #12, page 30d). Likewise, the responsa of Harav Menahem Azarya of Fano (#91) states that each time someone is called up to the Torah and he says *Barekhu et Hashem*, the congregation must stand up to respond *Barukh Hashem hamevorakh*. He based this ruling on the passage from the Talmud Yerushalmi cited here.

Nevertheless, Harav Hayim Vital (*Sha'ar Hakavanot*, *darush hakaddish*, page 16d, cited by the *Ture Zahav* 53:1) testified that the Arizal did not stand up to respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*, and argued that there is no such passage in the Talmud Yerushalmi. Rather, those words were added to a handwritten copy of the Talmud Yerushalmi by some scholar, and they were afterward mistakenly printed as if they were part of the original text. (The *Magen Avraham* {54:4} challenged this assertion.) If someone was already standing when the cantor began reciting kaddish, however, he must remain standing until he completes his response of *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*. This is likely to occur when kaddish is recited right after the repetition of the *Amida* or right after the Torah scroll has been returned to the Ark. In those circumstances, the Arizal remained standing until after he responded. This corresponds with the ruling of Harav Yaakov Moelin.

In practice

The custom of Sefardic Jews follows that of the Arizal, which is to remain seated while kaddish is recited unless one was already standing when the cantor began. This is recorded in the *Ben Ish Hai* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 8), the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (56:20), and the *Halikhot Olam* (Vol. I, page 89).

The custom of Ashkenazic Jews is to rise from one's seat to listen to kaddish or *Barekhu*, following the testimony of the *Darkhe Moshe*. This is likewise the ruling of Rama (gloss to 56:1) and the *Mishna Berura* (56:8).

At what point can one sit down?

The words of the *Ben Ish Hai* are that the person caught standing when kaddish begins must remain standing until he completes the 28-word response of *Yehe Shemeh rabba*. This is likewise the ruling of Maran the Rishon Letziyon (*Halikhot Olam* Vol. I, page 89). Apparently, once he completes this response he may sit down although the cantor is still reciting the half-kaddish.

The *Ale Hadas* (page 113), however, stated that the custom is to remain standing until the cantor completes the half-kaddish. He disagreed, however, with the stringent ruling of Harav Shelomo Zalman Auerbach (*Halikhot Shelomo Tefilla* page 81) and the *Piske Teshuvot* that the