תיבות, דהיינו עד "דאמירן בעלמא", אין לו להפסיק לענות אמן זו. וכן דעת רבינו האר"י בשער הכוונות.

אבל אם החזן או אומר הקדיש ממהר מאוד, והגיע לסיום חצי הקדיש, ואמר "דאמירן בעלמא ואמרו אמן", והוא עודנו באמצע כ"ח תיבות של "יהא שמה רבא מברך", יפסיק ויענה 'אמן', שאמן זה שהוא סיום חצי קדיש, יש הכרח לענותו, שהכל הולך אחר החתום.

ולכתחלה על השליח ציבור, וכן על מי שאומר קדיש, לומר "יהא שמה רבא" בנחת, לאט לאט, ולא למהר, כדי שיספיקו הקהל לענות עד "דאמירן בעלמא", ואחר כך יענו גם "אמן" אחר "שמיה דקודשא בריך הוא". [ראה ביבי"א ח"א סי' ה, ח"ו סי' ח אות ג, הליכו"ע ח"א עמ' צט]

יא. גם השליח צבור האומר קדיש, צריך לומר "יהא שמיה רבא" וכו'. אולם לא יאמר "אמן" יהא שמיה רבא. [רמ"א סי' נו ס"א]. [כה"ח ס"ק כז]

words until *da'amiran be'alma*. This follows the instructions of the Arizal in *Sha'ar Hakavanot*.[396]

If the cantor recites kaddish so quickly that he reaches the words *da'amiran be'alma ve'imru Amen* before the congregation has completed their response of *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*, however, they must cut themselves short and respond Amen to the end of the half-kaddish. It is vitally important to respond Amen at that point.[397]

In light of this, it is important for the cantor or anyone else reciting kaddish to recite it slow enough to enable the congregation to respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* properly and still be able to respond Amen to *Shemeh deKudsha berikh Hu*.

The cantor also recites *Yehe Shemeh*

11) The cantor, or whoever recites kaddish must also recite the sentence of *Yehe Shemeh rabba*,[398] but he does not repeat the preceding Amen.

396. The *Sha'ar Hakavanot* states that if the congregation or any individuals have completed their 28-word response of *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* by the time the cantor reaches the words *Shemeh deKudsha berikh Hu*, they should respond Amen at that point. It is obvious from this that if anyone in the congregation has not yet completed his 28-word response, he should not interrupt to respond Amen. This is the ruling of the responsa *Rav Pe'alim* (Vol. II, #38) and the *Petah Hadevir* (56:6). Maran the Rishon Letziyon (responsa *Yabia Omer* Vol. I, #5:4) deduced from this that according to the Arizal, we are definitely obligated to respond with 28 words for *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*, for if it was not an absolute obligation we ought to interrupt it in order to respond Amen to *Shemeh deKudsha berikh Hu*. Afterward he reconsidered, explaining that it might not be an absolute obligation, but even so we should not interrupt it since there is no halakhic obligation to respond Amen to *Shemeh deKudsha berikh Hu*.

397. Maran the Rishon Letziyon (responsa *Yabia Omer* VI, #8:3) ruled that in this case one must interrupt to respond Amen to the cantor, since it is most important to respond Amen to the end of the half-kaddish. He cited the *Tahorat Hamayim* (*Shiyure Tahora*, *ma'arekhet ayin*, #44) who issued this ruling, and he repeated it in *Halikhot Olam* (Vol. I, page 99).

The *Or Letziyon* (Vol. II, #85:10), however, ruled that even in this case one should not interrupt to respond Amen, and he argued that this is the ruling of the responsa *Rav Pe'alim* (Vol. II, #38). Maran the Rishon Letziyon did not concur with this interpretation.

The *Eshel Avraham* of Butchatch pointed out that if several people respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* until *da'amiran be'alma*, they are not to respond Amen to one another. They are to respond to the cantor only.

398. The cantor's *Yehe Shemeh rabba*

The *Mishna Berura* (56:2) states: "The cantor must also say the words *Yehe Shemeh rabba*... silently, and then

יב. יש מי שכתב שכשמתחיל השליח צבור 'יתגדל', יש לשומעים לומר פסוקים: ועתה יגדל נא כח וגו' (במדבר יד, יז), זכור רחמיך וגו' (תהילים כה, ו). [רמ"א סוף ס"א]. אולם לדעת האר"י אין לומר פסוקים אלו, וכן המנהג שלא לאומרם. [כה"ח ס"ק כט]

Reciting verses when kaddish begins

12) There was once a custom in some communities for the congregation to recite the verses of יִגְדַּל נָא כֹחַ אֲדֹנָי וגו' and זְכוֹר רַחֲמֶיךָ וגו' while the cantor recites the first words of kaddish. According to the Arizal, however, the congregation must not recite these verses at this time, and the common custom nowadays is not to recite them.

---

continue out loud beginning with *Yitbarakh*." This needs some explanation, for why shouldn't the cantor need to say this response "with all his power" like everyone else?

The responsa *Az Nidberu* (Vol. IX, #41) explained that the *Mishna Berura* means that the cantor may recite *Yehe Shemeh rabba* as loudly or softly as he wishes, but once he reaches the word *yitbarakh* he is obligated to resume reciting the words out loud. He pointed out that the source for this ruling is the *Levush* (56:3), and it follows the *Levush's* ruling (in *Siman* 57) regarding the response of *Barukh Hashem Hamevorakh le'olam va'ed* – the cantor must also recite this response, but he may choose to recite it silently. The *Levush* repeated this in *Siman* 139:6 regarding someone who is called up to read from the Torah – he should recite the response of *Barukh Hashem Hamevorakh le'olam va'ed* together with the congregation, but he may recite it silently.

The upshot of this discussion is that the main reason for the person reciting kaddish to add the response of *Yehe Shemeh rabba* is so that he does not exclude himself from the congregation. Therefore, it is sufficient for him to recite it silently if he chooses to.

The question now arises – since Sefardic Jews recite the 28-word response, why must the cantor recite the remainder of the kaddish out loud? Just as he may recite *Yehe Shemeh rabba* silently, he should be allowed to continue silently until *da'amiran be'alma*. Apparently, the cantor recites the remainder of kaddish expressly to enable the congregation to respond Amen to *berikh Hu* and to *da'amiran be'alma*. For this reason, the *Levush's* instructions for the cantor to resume reciting out loud beginning with *yitbarakh* applies to Sefardic Jews as well. Although the congregation has recited the word *yitbarakh* to fulfill the instructions of Harav Yosef Gikatilla, this word is the beginning of the sentence to which the congregation responds Amen, and therefore the cantor must recite it out loud. Of course, the cantor must not pause between the words *almaya* and *yitbarakh*, like everyone else. The common custom nowadays is for the cantor to recite the entire response of *Yehe Shemeh rabba* out loud.

For people who cannot respond themselves

The *Shulhan Arukh* (104:7) ruled that if someone in the middle of the *Amida* hears kaddish or *Kedusha*, he may not interrupt his prayers to respond. Instead, he should stop and listen to the cantor, and it will count for him as if he responded.

Obviously, this works only if the cantor recites the entire kaddish out loud, including the response of *Yehe Shemeh rabba*, so that the person or people reciting the *Amida* can hear him. This being the case, it must be that the *Mishna Berura's* ruling permitting the cantor to recite the words *Yehe Shemeh rabba* silently applies only to kaddish recited while no one present is in the middle of the *Amida*.

The responsa *Az Nidberu* (Vol. IX, #41) ruled that the person who is in the middle of the *Amida* does not have to hear the cantor reciting the response; he can fulfill his obligation by listening to the congregation responding. This is based on the *Levush's* ruling (109:3) that if someone is in the middle of the *Amida* when the congregation is reciting *Kedusha*, he should fulfill his obligation by listening to the congregation responding.

This seems to contradict the *Levush's* ruling (104:7) regarding kaddish, that the person must listen to the cantor reciting *Yehe Shemeh rabba*, not to the congregation. Moreover, it is not possible for someone to fulfill his own obligation by listening to someone else's prayer unless the person he listens to intends to recite it for the benefit of the one who is listening to it. The people in the congregation have no idea that anyone is depending on them for the response to kaddish or *Kedusha*, and so they have no such intentions. For the same reason, the *Od Yosef Hai* (*parashat Teruma* halakha 6) ruled that if the cantor does not know that he is supposed to have intentions on behalf of those listening to him, there is no reason for the people reciting the *Amida* to stop and listen to him. This is likewise the ruling of Maran the Rishon Letziyon (*Halikhot Olam* Vol. I, page 188). Therefore, it is up to the cantor to recite the response of *Yehe Shemeh rabba* out loud and to have intentions to recite it on behalf of those who are in the middle of the *Amida*.

יג. מצות עניית הקדיש של "יהא שמיה רבא" הוא שישמע העונה תחלת הקדיש שהוא ב' תיבות "יתגדל ויתקדש", כי "יהא שמיה רבא מברך" הוא עניה על יתגדל. לכן לכתחלה ישימו כל הציבור לבם לשמוע כל הקדיש מן תיבת "יתגדל" כדי לכוין על מה הם עונין. [באו"ח פי' ויחי ה"ג]

יד. הנכנס לבית הכנסת ומצא שהציבור עונים "יהא שמה רבא", יענה עמהם: יהא שמיה רבא מברך וכו'. ואפילו אם כבר המשיכו הצבור "מברך לעלם", יענה כן.
ולגבי עניית "אמן", נכון יותר שלא יענה "אמן", כיון שלא שמע תחלת הקדיש, אלא יתחיל "יהא שמה רבא", כאמור. ומכל מקום אם רצה לענות "אמן", יש לו על מה שיסמוך. [הליכות עולם ח"א עמ' פג]

Listening and concentrating

13) The correct way to fulfill the mitzvah of listening and responding to kaddish is to listen to [and concentrate on the meaning of] the first words of the kaddish – *yitgadal veyitkadash*, since the words *Yehe Shemeh rabba mevarakh* are in response to those words. It is best that the entire congregation listen and concentrate on all the words of kaddish so that each person will respond Amen to the ideas expressed in those words.

When you did not hear the cantor

14) If someone walks into a synagogue and finds the congregation responding *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*, he should join them and declare *Yehe Shemeh rabba mevarakh*..., even if he is several words behind the rest of the congregation. It is best that he omit the initial word Amen and begin only with *Yehe Shemeh* since he did not hear the cantor recite kaddish. If this person insists on beginning with the initial *Amen*, he has a halakhic basis to justify himself.[399]

---

399. The *Ben Ish Hai* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 3) ruled that if someone enters a synagogue and finds the congregation responding to kaddish he should join them. He added that the *Poskim* debated whether he is to respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* or to omit the Amen and begin with *Yehe Shemeh*. Some *Poskim* ruled that he must omit the word Amen since he did not hear the cantor recite kaddish. If he would respond Amen he would be guilty of reciting an "orphaned Amen." The author discussed this issue in *Mikabtze'el* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 47) and ruled that both opinions are acceptable, for each one has a basis in halakha.

Maran the Rishon Letziyon (*Halikhot Olam* Vol. I, page 83) cited *Poskim* who ruled that the person may recite Amen if he can quickly think of the initial words of kaddish so that the Amen will be directed toward those words, although he did not actually hear them. He then cited Harav HIDA (*Kesher Godal* 9:5) ruling that if someone heard people responding Amen to a blessing that he did not hear himself, he must not respond Amen with them since it would be considered an orphaned Amen although he knows full well to which blessing he is responding and even though he is not required to hear that blessing, since the cantor recited it on behalf of others. The *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (124:47) concurred with this. Based on this, Maran the Rishon Letziyon ruled that one must not respond Amen in this case; one should respond only *Yehe Shemeh rabba*.... Nevertheless, if someone insists on responding Amen, there is a halakhic basis to justify it. This concurs with the ruling of the *Ben Ish Hai*. The *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (124:61), however, ruled stringently that one must refrain from responding Amen.

The *Halakha Berura* (page 207) ruled that as long the person knows exactly to which blessing he is responding, he may respond Amen along with the congregation even though he did not hear the blessing at all. Even if some people have already finished responding Amen, he may still join the congregation as long as most of them are still pronouncing the word. This is in contrast to the more stringent ruling of Maran the Rishon Letziyon and the *Kaf Hahayim* recommending that he not respond Amen. In his discussion of this halakha, the author explained that the *Poskim* debated whether the rules that apply to blessings are identical to those applying to kaddish.

If the person enters the synagogue in time to hear the cantor recite the words *ve'imru Amen*, it appears from the language of the *Ben Ish Hai* that he still should not respond

מדיני הקדיש

טו. האומרים קדיש יקפידו לומר הקדיש ביחד, ולא יהיה אחד מקדים ואחד מאחר, כי אז מבלבלים את העונים. [כה"ח פאלאגי' סי' יג אות יא, כה"ח סופר ס"ק ל]. וע"ע לקמן הלכה מ"ז.

וכששומע קדיש משנים ואחד מקדים את חבירו, יענה אחר המקדים, ועולה לו כאילו ענה על שניהם. ואם יש הפסק בשיעור יותר מכדי דיבור ביניהם, יענה 'אמן' על כל אחד ואחד. [ע"פ חס"ל סי' נו ה"ו, באו"ח ויחי סוף הי"א, מקבציאל שם הל"ח. וע"ע במשנ"ב סי' נה סק"ד, כה"ח סי' נו סק"ח]

Details About Kaddish

Recite kaddish in unison

15) If several people in the congregation are reciting kaddish, they should make sure to recite it in unison at the same pace. If some people recite it quickly and others recite it slowly, it will confuse those who are listening and trying to respond. See below in halakha 47.

How to respond to several people at once

If one person recites the kaddish slightly more quickly than another, the people listening should respond to the one who is quicker. It will count for them as if they responded to both people reciting it. If the first person reaches the words *ve'imru Amen* a full second earlier than the second person, the congregation should respond Amen to the first person and again to the second person. The same applies to any point in kaddish where the congregation is supposed to respond.[400]

Amen since he did not hear the first words of kaddish. The *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer and the *Halakha Berura* both ruled that in this case he may definitely respond Amen. It is possible to interpret the words of the *Ben Ish Hai* to concur with their ruling.

If the cantor has begun the sentence of *Yehe Shemeh rabba*, anyone who enters the synagogue at that point should definitely not respond Amen. Since the cantor has already begun a new sentence, it is no longer possible to respond Amen to his previous sentence. This can be compared to a case where the cantor who is repeating the *Amida* begins the next blessing before the congregation has responded Amen to the previous blessing – they can no longer respond Amen.

400. The *Ben Ish Hai* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 11) ruled that the people reciting kaddish are not in unison, the congregation should respond to the person who reaches the words *Ve'imru Amen* first. In his *Sefer Mikabtze'el* (*parashat Vayehi* halakha 38) he added, citing the *Hesed La'alafim* (56:6), that if there is a full second between the two, the congregation should respond to each of them.

These rulings were preceded by the responsa *Halakhot Ketanot* (Vol. II, #48). He ruled, however, that as long as the two people reciting kaddish are within one second of each other, the listener may choose to answer the one or the other, and this ruling is cited in the *Mishna Berura* (55:4) and the *Hesed La'alafim* (56:6). If they both reach that point within a second of one another, the listener can respond to either one and it will count as a response to both. Apparently, according to the *Ben Ish Hai* and the *Hesed La'alafim*, it is preferable to respond to the one who recites the kaddish more quickly. More research is needed to determine why they favored this formula.

If someone is in a place where several groups of people are praying, each forming an independent minyan, it can happen that one group begins kaddish while its neighboring group is already in the middle of kaddish. In this case, the person listening should respond only to first group. Although he could technically respond to both, it is incorrect to mix up the order of one's responses. This cannot be compared to two people reciting kaddish together where one of them recites it at a faster pace.

Upon hearing kaddish and a blessing

The *Hesed La'alafim* (56:13, cited in *Mikabtze'el parashat Vayehi* halakha 44) ruled that if someone hears kaddish and at the same time he hears someone else recite a blessing, he should respond *Amen ve'Amen*.