ה. יש להשתדל לרוץ כדי לשמוע קדיש. [ש"ע ס"א]. כיון שעניית "אמן יהא שמיה רבא" היא מצוה גדולה מאד. [משנ"ב ס"ק ו]

ועניית "אמן יהא שמיה רבא" עדיפה יותר מעניית קדושה. [משנ"ב ס"ק ו, באח"ז ויחי הי"א, כה"ח ס"ק ג]. ולכן מי ששומע בבת אחת, ממנין אחד שאומרים "יהא שמיה רבא", וממנין שני שאומרים קדושה, יענה לקדיש "יהא שמיה רבא". [משנ"ב שם].

וזה שאמרנו שקדיש קודם לקדושה, היינו בשאינו מחויב באותה קדושה לצאת בה ידי חובתו, כגון שעדיין לא התפלל שמונה עשרה, או כבר התפלל עמידה וחזרה וענה קדושה, אבל אם הקדושה ההיא מחויב בה לענות עכשיו, כגון שהתפלל שמונה עשרה ושומע כעת חזרת הש"ץ והגיע לומר קדושה, ואז שומע קדיש ממקום אחר, בזה קדושה קודמת, כיון שמצוה בשעתה עדיפא, וכאן הוא מקומה. [כה"ח ס"ק ה]

Day 73

Run to hear kaddish

5) The merit of responding *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* is enormous, and therefore one should run if necessary to gain the opportunity to perform this mitzvah.[388] The merit of responding of *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* is greater than that of responding to *Kedusha*. Therefore, if someone hears one congregation reciting kaddish and at the same time he hears another congregation reciting *Kedusha*, he should respond to the kaddish and ignore the *Kedusha*.[389]

This is true if the person does not need the *Kedusha* for his daily prayers, either because he is going to join his own congregation soon for *Kedusha* or because he has already recited *Kedusha* earlier during the repetition of the *Amida*. If he is listening to the repetition of the *Amida* with his own congregation and happens to hear kaddish at that time, it is more important for him to respond to the *Kedusha* and to ignore the kaddish.

388. This is the ruling of the *Shulhan Arukh* based on a passage in the *Zohar* (*Teruma* page 166a): "Since I saw him jump down from the roof in order to hear kaddish with the congregation, I made up my mind to offer my daughter to him. When the congregation left the synagogue, I gave him my daughter's hand in marriage. I said to myself that if he went to such extreme efforts to hear the kaddish he must be a great Torah scholar."

389. If he had not yet heard *Kedusha*

The *Mishna Berura* (125:8) ruled that if this person had already heard kaddish that day and he had not yet heard *Kedusha*, then it is better for him to respond to the *Kedusha* and ignore the kaddish. That way, he fulfills his daily requirement for both these mitzvot. Likewise, the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (125:5) stipulated that this is true only if this person will not have another opportunity to hear *Kedusha* afterward. If he expects to be able to hear *Kedusha* later on, he should respond to the kaddish at this time even though he did not hear the *Kedusha* earlier.

Two synagogues

If someone realizes that if he turns to one synagogue he will catch the cantor reciting *kaddish titkabal*, and if he turns to a second synagogue he will catch the *Kedusha*, he should go to the second synagogue. In that way, he will hear *Kedusha* and soon afterward he will hear *kaddish titkabal* as well. This is the ruling of the *Magen Avraham*, the *Mishna Berura* (56:6), and the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (56:4). The *Kaf Hahayim* ruled that this is the halakha even if it means passing by the first synagogue in order to reach the second synagogue, refuting the *Shalme Tzibbur* who ruled that it is forbidden to pass up the first synagogue.

ו. מי שהתחיל לענות "אמן יהא שמיה רבא", ושמע ממנין אחר שאומרים קדושה, לא יפסיק לעניית הקדושה [משנ"ב סוף ס"ק ח], ומכל מקום מוטב שיאמר עד "לעלמי עלמיא יתברך" בלבד (ולא כנהוג כ"ח תיבות על "בעלמא"), כדי שיוכל לענות קדוש עם הקהל, ובזה יהא שכר קדיש וקדושה בידו. [יבי"א ח"י סי' ח אות ג] וכן אם התחיל לענות קדושה, ושמע מנין אחר שאומרים "אמן יהא שמיה רבא", לא יפסיק כדי לענות עמהם. [ראה משנ"ב סי' נו סוף סק"י, וסי' קכה סוף סק"ח. ובא"ח ויחי הי"א, וכה"ח סי' נו סק"י, וסי' קכה ס"ק יז]

ז. מה שיש נוהגים לומר עם השליח צבור הקדיש כשהוא מנגן, לא אריך למעבד הכי, דלא ניתן הקדיש אלא לשליח צבור. [כה"ח סי' נו ס"ק טז]. אלא יש להם רק להקשיב ולענות אחריו "אמן" ו"יהא שמיה רבה".

ח. בחצי קדיש, עונים השומעים חמש אמנים, וכפי הסדר דלהלן: **א.** אחר "שמיה רבא". **ב.** אחר

Interrupting kaddish for *Kedusha*

6) If someone is in the middle of responding *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* and he hears another congregation beginning *Kedusha*, he should not interrupt and respond to that *Kedusha*. In this case, the best solution is to respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*, but only up to the words *le'alme almaya yitbarakh*, and then respond to the *Kedusha*. In this way, he can fulfill both mitzvot.

If someone is in the middle of responding to *Kedusha* and he hears another congregation beginning kaddish, he must not interrupt the *Kedusha* to respond to the kaddish.

Singing along with the cantor

7) In some congregations, the people join the cantor when he sings the words of the kaddish. This practice is improper since the cantor is supposed to recite the kaddish alone. Everyone else should listen attentively and respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*.[390]

Amen five times

8) The congregation responds Amen five times to the half-kaddish, following the Arizal's instructions: **1)** after the initial phrase ending *Shemeh rabba*[391]; **2)** after the words *vikarev Meshiheh*[392]; **3)** after the words *uvizman kariv*

---

390. This ruling is found in the responsa of Rabbenu Asher (4:19), and the *Aharonim* cite it in the name of Harav HIDA (*Kesher Godal* 8:15). See also the *Yafe Lalev* (HaKeter edition 56:22) and the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (56:16).

391. Rambam explained this in his version of the prayers, as cited in the *Bet Yosef*. The *Mishna Berura* (56:12) expressed amazement at the fact that this is not mentioned in the *Shulhan Arukh*.

392. Neither Rambam, in his version of the prayers, nor the *Shulhan Arukh* mention this response of Amen, but this is the custom based on the Arizal's instructions as they are presented in the *Sha'ar Hakavanot*. See the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (56:29). Maran wrote in his *Maggid Mesharim* (*parashat Toledot*) that the angel instructed him to respond Amen five times during kaddish, and one of those times is after the words *vikarev Meshiheh*. According to some *Rishonim*, the words *veyatzmah purkaneh vikarev Meshiheh* are not recited at all in kaddish, and this is the custom of Ashkenazic Jews.

When praying in an Ashkenazic synagogue

The *Or Letziyon* (Vol. II, 5:11) ruled that if a Sefardic Jew is praying in an Ashkenazic congregation and he wishes to recite kaddish, he may recite the version that he is used to, and he does not have to alter it to match the Ashkenazic version. Therefore, he may add the phrases of *veyatzmah purkaneh vikarev Meshiheh*, thus fulfilling the directives of

ויקרב משיחיה". **ג.** אחר "ובזמן קריב ואמרו אמן". **ד.** אחר "שמיה דקודשא בריך הוא". **ה.** אחר "דאמירן בעלמא ואמרו אמן". וכן מבואר לדעת האר"י שיש לענות חמשה אמנים. [כה"ח ס"ק כט]

וכוונת ה"אמן" של הקדישים הוא, כן יהי רצון. [חסד לאלפים סי' נו ה"ט, מקבציאל ויחי המ"ה, כה"ח סי' ה ס"ק יד]

ve'imru Amen[393]; **4)** after the words *Shemeh deKudsha Berikh Hu*[394]; and **5)** after the final words *da'amiran be'alma ve'imru Amen*. When responding Amen at these five junctures, one should have in mind the concept of "*This should be God's Will*."

---

the Kabbalah as found in the *Sha'ar Hakavanot*. However, if he knows that the congregation will be incensed by this, he should recite the Ashkenazic version for the sake of keeping the peace.

If one Sefardic Jew recites kaddish along with several Ashkenazic Jews, his *veyatzmaḥ purkaneh vikarev Meshiḥeh* will be drowned out by the others and the congregation will not respond Amen to him. Even if they do hear him, they will likely not respond Amen since they are not used to it. In these cases, it is preferable to simply recite the Ashkenazic version unless the congregation recognizes the Sefardic version and do not mind having someone recite it. Nowadays, in communities that have both Sefardic and Ashkenazic Jews praying in the synagogues, the prevalent practice is for each person to recite his own version of kaddish.

According to Rambam, the five times of Amen in kaddish are: 1) after the initial phrase ending *Shemeh rabba*; 2) after the words *uvizman kariv ve'imru Amen*; 3) after the word *Yitbarakh*; after the words *Shemeh deKudsha Berikh Hu*; and 5) after the final words *da'amiran be'alma ve'imru Amen*. These are the instructions given in his version of the prayers, but in *Hilkhot Tefilla* (9:1) Rambam counted only two responses of Amen to kaddish. The responsa *Nishmat Kol Ḥai* (page 7a, cited in responsa *Yabia Omer* Vol. I, footnote to #5:9) resolved this contradiction, explaining that the Talmudic halakha demands only two responses, but the custom is to respond Amen five times during kaddish.

393. This is the universal custom regarding the text of the kaddish, which is that the cantor instructs the congregation, "*v'imru Amen* – respond Amen." It is the uncontested ruling of Rambam (*Hilkhot Tefilla* 9:1), the *Shulḥan Arukh* (56:2), and the Arizal.

394. This is the ruling of Rambam (text of the prayers), the *Shulḥan Arukh* (56:2), and the Arizal (*Sha'ar Hakavanot*, cited in the *Kaf Haḥayim* Sofer 56:29). The custom of Ashkenazic Jews, based on the comment of Rama (gloss to 56:2), however, is not to respond Amen to the words *berikh Hu*. The common custom of Ashkenazic Jews today is to respond by repeating the words *Berikh Hu* at this point in kaddish.

There was a time when it was common for Ashkenazic Jews to respond *berikh Hu le'ela* – May He be blessed Above. The *Mishna Berura* (56:13) complained that this is blasphemy, for it suggests that God is blessed Above but not on earth. He suggested that they respond *berikh Hu le'ela mikal birkhata* – May He be blessed more than every blessing, or to suffice with *berikh Hu*.

The responsa *Igrot Moshe* (Vol. II, #16) ruled that if someone is in the middle of *Pesuke dezimra* and he hears the cantor reciting kaddish, he should not interrupt his prayers to respond *berikh Hu*, since the halakha does not require one to respond at that point in kaddish. This is likewise the ruling of Harav Shelomo Zalman Auerbach (*Halikhot Shelomo Tefilla*). Harav Yaakov Kaminetzky and Harav Ḥayim Kanyevski ruled that it is best not to respond *berikh Hu* to the kaddish preceding the *Amida* of *arvit*. Harav Moshe Feinstein, however, ruled that it is permissible. This debate applies to Ashkenazic Jews only.

Amen following *yitbarakh*

Rambam and the *Shulḥan Arukh* (56:2) ruled that the congregation should respond Amen after the cantor recites the word *yitbarakh*. The Rama commented that the common custom is not to respond at that point. The *Od Yosef Ḥai* (*parashat Vayeḥi* halakha 7) and the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer (56:29 and 56:32) commented that since the Arizal likewise did not instruct us to respond Amen at that point in kaddish, Sefardic Jews have adopted the practice of not responding.