שבעל פה ואומר קדיש "על ישראל", או להפך, לית לן בה, שאין בזה מרבה בקדישים. ולכך יש נוהגים לומר כל יום אחר קביעות תורה שבעל פה קדיש "על ישראל", ואחר כך לומדים תהלים ואומרים קדיש "יהא שלמא". וכן עושים בליל חג השבועות והושענא רבא. [בא"ח שם. מקבציאל ויחי הכ"ב]

עניה על הקדיש

ג. יש לכוין בעניית הקדיש [ש"ע סי' נו ס"א], כי אמרו חז"ל [שבת קיט ע"ב] כל העונה "אמן יהא שמיה רבא מברך" בכל כחו, קורעין לו גזר דינו. ופירשו הראשונים, הכוונה 'בכל כחו' בכל כונתו ובכל איבריו,

kaddish of *Yehe shelama*, and afterward they study a portion of the Oral Torah together, they may afterward recite the kaddish of *Al Yisrael*. The same is true if they first studied the Oral Torah and then chanted a portion of the Written Torah. In these cases, they are not guilty of reciting an unnecessary kaddish [since each kaddish applies to the portion of Torah that they just studied].

Therefore, in some communities the custom is to recite the kaddish of *Al Yisrael* after a Torah-study session, and then to recite a number of Psalms from *Tehillim*, followed by the kaddish of *Yehe shelama*. This is likewise the common practice during the nights of Shavuot and Hosha'na Rabba.

Day 72

Responding to Kaddish

Concentrating on the words' meaning

3) It is imperative to concentrate on the meaning of one's words when responding to kaddish, especially since our Sages promised that: "Heaven will rip up any sentence of punishments for anyone who responds, '*Amen, Yehe*

added that the ruling of the *Hesed La'alafim* and the *Ben Ish Hai* concurred with this ruling.

The half-kaddish before *arvit*

Based on the above, the *Halakha Berura* (page 194) ruled that when a congregation joins for a Torah-learning session in the evening followed by *arvit*, once they recite the kaddish of *Al Yisrael* at the conclusion of the learning session they should not recite another half-kaddish before *arvit*. Instead, they should continue directly with *Vehu rahum*.

In fact, this was the daily practice of Maran the Rishon Letziyon, as the *Yalkut Yosef* testified (*Siman* 237). Nevertheless, it is difficult to understand the connection between this issue and the halakha of avoiding the repetition of kaddish unnecessarily. That halakha applies to people who repeat the same type of kaddish for the same purpose unnecessarily. In this case, the first kaddish is connected to the Torah-learning session, while the second half-kaddish is connected to the *arvit* prayer. It is no worse than reciting one kaddish after reciting passages from the Written Torah and then another kaddish after studying the Oral Torah.

Apparently, the opinion of Maran the Rishon Letziyon was that, since the group recites the first kaddish only moments before beginning *arvit*, the one kaddish can serve both purposes. This was likewise the opinion of Harav Mordekhai Shar'abi and Harav Ben Tziyon Abba Shaul, as testified in the *Tif'eret Tziyon* (p. 349).

This ruling applies when the congregation continues after the kaddish directly into *arvit*. If there is an interruption, they should recite the half-kaddish before beginning *arvit*. Harav Meir Mazuz (*Makor Ne'eman*) issued a similar ruling regarding *arvit* on Friday evening: After the rabbi's Torah lecture, the cantor should go directly to the half-kaddish preceding *Barekhu*. If people in the congregation insist on reciting the kaddish of *Al Yisrael* after the lecture, they should schedule another section of the prayers such as *Lekhu neranena* or *Shir Hashirim* after the congregation's kaddish, and then the cantor repeats the verse of *Edutecha* and recites the half-kaddish. See also *Shema Shelomo* (Vol. VIIII, *Y.D.* #7).

דהיינו שיאמרנה בלב ונפש, ולא רק כמוציא שפתיו, וליבו בל עמו. גם יכוין לשמוע הקדיש מפי השליח צבור, כדי שידע על מה הוא עונה "אמן יהא שמיה רבא" ו"אמן" שאחר דאמירן בעלמא. וצריך לזהר מאוד באומרו השבח הזה הקדוש והנורא, לאומרו בתכלית כל דעתו וכונתו בו, שלא יכנס במחשבתו שום מחשבה אחרת כלל וכלל, וכל הזהיר וזריז הנה שכרו אתו, שאמרו (שבת קיט ע"ב), שקורעין לו גזר דינו של שבעים שנה. ועוד אמרו (שם) כל העונה "אמן" בכל כוחו, פותחין לו שערי גן עדן. [מקבציאל ויחי הנ"ה]

וכל שכן שצריך ליזהר מאד ומאד, שלא להשיח באמצע קדיש או קדושה. [משנ"ב שם, וכה"ח ס"ק ב] ואפילו להרהר בדברי תורה אסור בשעה שהחזן אומר קדיש, מפני שצריך לכוין הרבה בעניית הקדיש. [משנ"ב שם בשם הפר"ח].

Shemeh rabba mevarakh,' with all his strength.'' The *Rishonim* explained the words ''all his strength'' to mean, ''with all his concentration, exerting every part of his body.'' One must not simply respond the words without bothering to think of their meaning. Therefore, it is important to pay attention to the words of kaddish as the cantor recites them so that the *Amen* responses will sincerely echo the kaddish's sentiments. Above all, one must take great care not to engage in any discussion while kaddish or *Kedusha* are being recited.[383]

Our Sages promised great rewards for fulfilling this mitzvah properly, declaring that even if someone was sentenced to suffer for seventy years, this mitzvah can cause the sentence to be commuted. Also, the Gates of Gan Eden will be thrown open for him.[384] Conversely, it is a grave sin to converse with others while kaddish or *Kedusha* is being recited.

In fact, the obligation to concentrate on the words' meaning when responding to kaddish is so great that it is forbidden to think about Torah thoughts while the cantor recites kaddish. Likewise, we must take great care not to perform any task, however great or small, while responding to kaddish, since this is the praise of the mighty King of kings,

383. This is the ruling of the *Mishna Berura* (56:1), citing tractate *Derekh Eretz* as the source. This passage is cited in the *Bet Yosef* in *Siman* 125: Ribbi Hama discovered Eliyahu the prophet leading several thousands of camels loaded with anger and wrath with which to punish those who converse while kaddish is being recited. The verse (*Yeshayahu* 43:22): ''You did not call upon Me, Yaakov; you made Me weary, Yisrael,'' refers to those people.

The *Sefer Hassidim* relates that a devout Jew once had a vision of a devout colleague who had passed away some years before, and he saw the man's face distorted with anguish. He asked, ''Why is your expression so pained?'' The apparition replied, ''This happened to me because I used to converse while the cantor recited *Vaykhulu* and the blessing of *Magen Avot* on Friday evenings.''

The *Matte Moshe* (#411; cited in the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer 56:2) cites a Midrash relating that a scholar once had a vision of a former disciple who had passed away, and he noticed a dark stain on the man's forehead. He asked him what it meant, and the disciple told him, ''This is a symbol of my punishment for not taking care not to converse while the cantor recited kaddish.

384. See the preface to this *Siman* for a list of the rewards promised for responding to kaddish with the proper concentration.

וכן צריך ליזהר, שלא לעשות שום מלאכה אפילו דבר קל, בשעת עניית הקדיש שהוא שבחו של מלך מלכי המלכים הקב"ה ויש בו רזין עלאין, ולא כקצת בני אדם שמקפלין הטלית או התפילין בשעת עניית הקדיש. [כה"ח סי' ה ס"ק ג. וכ"ה במשנ"ב סי' כה ס"ק נו]

ואין חילוק בזה, בין קדיש על תנ"ך או אגדה או משניות. [משנ"ב שם, כה"ח סוף ס"ק ב]

ד. בשבת [קיט ע"ב] איתא: אמר רבי יהושע בן לוי, כל העונה אמן יהא שמיה רבא מברך בכל כחו, קורעין לו גזר דינו, ע"כ. ובכל כוחו, יש לקיים שיענה בכל כוונתו, וגם בקול רם [ראה ש"ע סי' נו ס"א], כי

---

the Blessed Holy One, and its words represent deep kabbalistic secrets. This applies equally to the kaddish recited after a passage of the Written Torah or after a lesson in Aggadah or the Mishnah.[385]

With all one's strength

4) The Talmud (*Shabbat* 119b) teaches: Ribbi Yehoshua ben Levi said, "Anyone who responds *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba mevarakh* with all his strength gains such merit that Heaven rips up any document stating that he is condemned to be punished." The term "with all his strength" means with all one's

---

385. To How Much of Kaddish Does This Apply?

The *Yalkut Yosef Tefillin English Edition* (footnote to *Siman* 25:78) cited the *Mishne Halakhot* ruling that it is forbidden to wind up the tefillin straps to put them away while responding *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabbah*, but one may do so while listening to the cantor recite kaddish. We challenged this ruling, and we concluded that this leniency applies while listening to a kaddish recited in the final sections of *shaḥarit*, but during a kaddish recited in the earlier sections of *shaḥarit* (kaddish before *Barekhu*, *kaddish titkabal*, *kaddish Yehe Shelama* before the *ketoret*) it is necessary to stop all activity and listen attentively to the kaddish.

After the cantor has completed the half-kaddish, however, it ought to be permissible to wind up the tefillin as the cantor recites the balance of the kaddish, since the additional sections are not part of the original kaddish composed in the Talmudic era.

Reciting One's Prayers During Kaddish

My friend Adam Azrack, *nr"u*, asked us what the halakha is when someone falls behind the cantor's pace in the prayers – may he catch up while the cantor (or anyone else) is reciting kaddish? I answered him that, according to the *Mishna Berura*, he must stop and listen to the half-kaddish, but after that he may continue his own prayers while the cantor recites the final passages of kaddish.

According to Harav Shelomo Zalman Auerbach (*Halikhot Shelomo Tefilla* page 82), even if someone was not paying attention and is unaware exactly which section of kaddish he is responding to, he may respond *Amen* to kaddish.

Interrupting Torah Learning to Listen to Kaddish

Harav Shelomo Zalman Auerbach (*Halikhot Shelomo Tefilla* page 122) ruled that if someone is studying Torah and a congregation nearby is praying, he has no obligation to stop and respond to any kaddish that the cantor recites. Nonetheless, he should stop to respond to *Kedusha*, *Barekhu*, or *Modim* since the people will likely notice if he does not respond. Likewise, he should stop and listen attentively to the *kohanim's* blessings for the congregation, even if he already had participated in those blessings earlier that day. All this applies to an individual studying Torah; if a group is studying together, they should not interrupt to respond to any of the above. Moreover, this applies when the individual is in the same room as the congregation. If he is in a different room, he has no obligation to respond to the congregation's prayers at all. See the *Piske Teshuvot* (*Siman* 215, page 829). The responsa *Kene Bosem* (Vol. III, #4) disagreed with these rulings, stating that in every situation one must respond to whatever he hears the cantor recite.

על ידי הקול הרם מתעורר הכוונה, ועל ידי קול זה מתבטלים גזירות קשות. ומכל מקום לא יתן קולות גדולות שיתלוצצו עליו בני אדם ויגרום להם חטא. [משנ"ב ס"ק ה]

אלא רק יגביה את קולו מעט, ולא ירים יותר מקול האומר קדיש, כדין העונה אמן שאינו רשאי להגביה קולו יותר מן המברך. [באו"ח פ' ויחי הי"א, כה"ח ס"ק טו]. ברם אם כונתו בהרימו קולו כדי לזרז להעם שיענו גם הם, מותר להגביה קולו יותר מן המברך. [משנ"ב סי' קכד ס"ק מז]

concentration and feeling, and it means to respond loudly. By raising one's voice, one is better able to rouse one's feelings, and this is what nullifies decrees of punishment. Even so, no one should not scream the words so loudly that it makes others scorn him.[386] The proper balance is to respond in a louder tone than one normally speaks. Moreover, the people responding must not raise their voices above that of the cantor.[387] If the person's intention is to inspire those around him to respond properly, however, he may raise his voice above that of the cantor.

386. Rashi (comment to *Shabbat* 119b) interpreted "all his strength" to mean with all his feeling and concentration. Rabbenu Yitzhak (cited in Tosafot) interpreted it as responding loudly, based on a passage in the *Pesikta*. Rabbenu Yona (*Berakhot* 13b) ruled that both interpretations are correct. Certainly, one must respond with great feeling and concentration, and for many people this can be accomplished only if they respond loudly and forcefully. Nevertheless, he added, no one should respond so loudly that he invites scorn from others. The *Bet Yosef* (*Siman* 56) cited the *Zohar* teaching that one must respond loudly. The *Petah Hadevir* deduced from Rabbenu Yona's commentary that if someone can muster all his feelings and concentration while responding quietly, he does not have to respond loudly.

The *Shulhan Arukh* (56:1) ruled that one must respond with all one's concentration and with a loud voice. The *Magen Avraham* warned that one should not invite the scorn of others. See also the comments of the *Ma'amar Mordekhai* (56:3) and the *Petah Hadevir* (56:3).

387. This is the ruling of *Shiyure Kenesset Hagedola*, the *Eliya Rabba*, the *Hesed La'alafim*, and *Ben Ish Hai* (all cited in the *Kaf Hahayim* Sofer 56:15). The *Peri Megadim* (*Mishbetzot Zahav* 56:1) stated that this limitation applies only to an *Amen* that is a response to the cantor's praise of God. The response of *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba*, however, is not simply a praise; it is a prayer and request. Therefore, one may respond in a voice louder than that of the cantor. This is likewise the ruling of Harav Shelomo Zalman Auerbach (*Halikhot Shelomo Tefilla* page 81), who added that this appears to be the opinion of Rabbenu Yona, since he needed to warn us not to raise our voices so loudly that we invite others' scorn, implying that as long as it is not that loud, we may raise our voices louder than the cantor.

It is possible to refute this proof by suggesting that Rabbenu Yona's ruling applies in a case where the cantor himself has a booming voice, and if someone responds any louder than the cantor he will certainly invite scorn from others.

The Cantor Ought to Be Loud

The *Kaf Hahayim* Palachi (13:13) taught that the rule forbidding the congregation to respond louder than the cantor is derived from the verse (*Tehillim* 34:4): "גַּדְּלוּ לַה' אִתִּי וּנְרוֹמְמָה שְׁמוֹ יַחְדָּו – express the greatness of God with me and we will exalt His Name together." That is, come together with me, the cantor, but do not drown out my voice. Nevertheless, he added, the cantor must take into account that the halakha demands that the congregation respond *Amen Yehe Shemeh rabba* loudly, and therefore he must also make sure to recite the kaddish in a loud, clear voice to enable to congregation to respond loudly without exceeding his volume.